it should be telecast. The price is Rs. 175|- and we had also been promised that we would get copies and I had requested the officers of both the Houses. I have written a letter to the honourable Chairman of the House and the honourable Speaker stating that this historic event should be telecast direct so that the common man has the reach. I do not know what has happened to my request and I do not know whether it is being telecast.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I do not know. Anyway, it is being recorded.... (*Interruptions*)....

SHRI DINESHBHAI TRIVEDI : Would you not agree that it is an important matter ?.... (*Interruptions*)....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You did not tell me earlier.... (*Interruptions*)....

SHRI DINESHBHAI TRIVEDI : Madam, right from *kabaddi* to cricket match and film festivals, we telecast many things and the citizens of this country have a right to direct information and they have a right to know who has swindled money .... (*Interruptions*)....

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH Maharashtra) : This is neither *kabaddi* nor cricket.... (*Interruptions*)....

SHRI DINESHBHAI TRIVEDI : It is more important that those things.... (*Interruptions*).... It is much more important than those things.... (*Interruptions*)....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I do not know; I will have to find out.... (*Interruptions*)....

SHRI DINESHBHAI TRIVEDI : Madam, what I am trying to emphasise is that less important things have also been telecast. I think this event should be telecast direct... (*Interruptions*)....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have not received any letter and the Chairman did not give me. सिकन्दर बख्त साहब, इनको चुप करा दें तो आप बोल पाएंगे ।

I do not know because you had written to the Chairman and I have no instructions from the Chairman as far as this thing is concerned... (*Interruptions*)...

एक मिनट, आप बैठिए । जरा सब से सुनिए जो हुआ है ।

I have no instructions from the Chairman that it should be shown live. So, that is it. But we are recording it for posterity.... (*Interruptions*)..

SHRI DINESHBHAI TRIVEDI : Would you consider telecasting it live ?... (*Interruptions*)....

Re : CONSIDERATION OF JPC REPORT BY THE GOVERNMENT

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : How can we do it now ? .... (*Interruptions*)....

आप बोलिए सिकन्दर बख्त साहब ।

विपक्ष के नेता (**श्री सिकन्दर बख्त**) : सदर साहिबा, मैं आपकी तवज्जो तीन बातों की तरफ दिलाना चाहता हूं और चाहूंगा कि अपाकी रूलिंग उन पर हो जाए । एक अखबार में पढ़ा है कि

a high-power panel is being set up to trace the scam money.

मेरा कहना यह है कि.....

†[ویکشھ کے نیتا شری سکندر بخت : صدر صاحبہ میں آپکی توجہ تین باتوں کی طرف دلانا چاہتا ہوں اور چاہوں گا کہ آپکی رولنگ ان پر ہو جائے۔ ایک اخبار میں پڑھا ہے کہ۔

a high-power panel is being set up to trace the scam money.

میرا کہنا ہے کہ۔.....]

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

Since it arises out of the JPC Report which both the Houses are going to consider, such an announcement should have been made on the floor of the House.

पार्लियामेंट में इसका प्लान होना चाहिए था, यह अखबारात में पहले से कैसा आ गया । तो इस सिलसिले में मैं चाहूंगा कि आप कुछ फरमाएं? दूसरी बात मैं यह जानना चाहता हूं कि यह जे.पी.सी. की रिपोर्ट यूनेनिमस है । तमाम पार्टीज के मेंबर्स जे.पी.सी. के मेंबर रहे हैं । गवर्नमेंट का या पार्लियामेंट का एटीट्यूड इसके बारे में क्या होगा? क्या इस हाऊसेज में डिस्कशन का नतीजा यह भी हो सकता है कि यह रिपोर्ट रिजेक्ट की जाए या एक्सेप्ट की जाए? इस सिलसिले में आपकी रूलिंग चाहूंगा? और तीसरी बात यह कहना चाहता हूं, आपने मेहरबानी से क्या गौर कर लिया दोनों बातों पर? मैंने दो बातें अर्ज कीं ।

†[شری سکندر بخت : پارلیمنٹ میں اس کا اعلان ہونا چاہئے تھا یہ اخبارات میں پہلے سے کیسے آگیا۔ تو اس سلسلے میں میں چاہونگا کہ آپ کچھ فرمائیں دوسری بات میں یہ جاننا چاہتا ہوں کہ یہ جے۔ پی۔ سی۔ کی رپورٹ یونینیمس ہے۔ تمام پارٹیز کے ممبرس جے۔ پی۔ سی۔ کے ممبر رہے ہیں۔ گورنمنٹ کا یا پارلیمنٹ کا ایٹیٹیوڈ اسکے بارے میں کیا ہو گا۔ کیا ان ہاؤسز میں ڈسکشن کا نتیجہ یہ بھی ہو سکتا ہے کہ یہ رپورٹ ریجیکٹ کی جائے یا ایکسیپٹ کی جائے اس سلسلے میں آپکی رولنگ چاہونگا اور تیسری بات یہ کہنا چاہتا ہوں کہ آپ نے مہربانی سے کیا غور کر لیا دونوں باتوں پر۔ میں نے دو باتیں عرض کیں۔]

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

उप सभापति: मैंने दो सुनली ।

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : तीसरी बात यह अर्ज करना चाहता हूं कि जे.पी.सी. की रिपोर्ट 22 तारीख को आई थी । 22 तारीख को ही गवर्नमेंट का रेस्पोंस आना चाहिए था कि जे.पी.सी. के जो बराहेरास्त इल्जाम लगे हैं या बिलवास्ता इल्जाम लगे हैं कुछ, उन इल्जामात पर गवर्नमेंट कौन से कदम उठाना चाह रही है? यह गवर्नमेंट के रेस्पोंसेज जे.पी.सी. की रिपोर्ट पर डिस्कशन से पहले आने चाहिए थे ताकि इस किस्म का डिस्कशन बा-मकसद हो सकता। गवर्नमेंट के रेस्पोंज को सामने रखकर इस पर बहस की जा सकती । बदकिस्मती से गवर्नमेंट खामोश है और बल्कि अलग-अलग डायरेक्शंस में मामलात को लिया जा रहा है और यहां तो हम यह देखते आए हैं कि बहुत बड़े-बड़े किस्से होते हैं, फ्लकशिगाफ़ किस्से होते हैं और उसको फिर लम्बा किया जाता है और फिर वह बताशे की तरह बात बैठ जाती है । इस दफा भी जेरे-बहस मसला मनमोहन सिंह साहब का रेजिगनेशन आ गया है । अब मालूम नहीं है कि उसका क्या हो रहा है । वह मंजूर होगा या नहीं मंजूर होगा? लेकिन मैं ऐसा मानता हूं कि वह डायग्रेशन है । जे.पी.सी. की रिपोर्ट में सिर्फ मनमोहन सिंह साहब का जिक्र नहीं है या मिनिस्ट्रीयल रेस्पोंसिबिलिटी का जिक्र नहीं है । कुछ मिनिस्टर्स का, कुछ आफिसर्स का, कुछ महकमों का जिक्र है और सी.बी.आई. का जिक्र है, कुछ ऐसी पी.एस. यूज. का जिक्र है जो बराहेरास्त प्राईम मिनिस्टर साहब के मातहत आते हैं । तो मैं जानना चाहता हूं कि इन तमाम बातों का बाकी चीजों के सिलसिले में गवर्नमेंट के रेस्पोंसेज क्या हैं? रेस्पोंसेज का पता चले तो जे.पी.सी. की रिपोर्ट पर बहस करने का कोई मकसद, कोई मतलब निकल सकता है। लिहाजा मेरी दरख्वास्त यह है कि इस सिलसिले में गवर्नमेंट से कहा जाए कि वह अपने रेस्पोंसेज बताए? ..... (व्यवधान)

†[شری سکندر بخت : تیسری بات یہ عرض کرنا چاہتا ہوں کہ جے۔ پی۔ سی۔ کی رپورٹ ۲۲ تاریخ کو آئی تھی

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

۲۲ تاریخ کو ہی گورنمنٹ کا ریسپونس آنا چاہئے تھا کہ جے۔ پی۔ سی۔ کے جو براہ راست الزام لگے ہیں یا بالواسطہ الزام لگے ہیں کچھ ان الزامات پر گورنمنٹ کونسے قدم اٹھانا چاہ رہی ہے۔ یہ گورنمنٹ کے ریسپانسیز جے۔ پی۔ سی۔ کی رپورٹ پر ڈسکشن سے پہلے آنے چاہئے تھے تاکہ اس قسم کا ڈسکشن بامقصد ہو سکتا۔ گورنمنٹ کے ریسپونسیز کو سامنے رکھکر اس پر بحث کی جاسکتی ہے۔ بدقسمتی سے گورنمنٹ خاموش ہے اور بلکہ الگ الگ ڈائرکشن میں معاملات کو لیا جا رہا ہے اور یہاں تو ہم یہ دیکھتے آئے ہیں کہ بہت بڑے بڑے قصے ہوتے ہیں۔ فلک شگاف قصے ہوتے ہیں اور اسکو پھر لمبا کیا جاتا ہے اور پھر وہ بتاشے کی طرح بات بیٹھ جاتی ہے۔ اس دفعہ بھی زیر بحث مسئلہ من موہن سنگھ صاحب کا ریزگنیشن آگیا ہے اب معلوم نہیں ہے کہ اسکا کیا ہو رہا ہے۔ وہ منظور ہو گا یا نہیں منظور ہوگا۔ لیکن میں ایسا مانتا ہوں کہ وہ ڈائگریشن ہے۔ جے۔ پی۔ سی۔ کی رپورٹ میں صرف من موہن سنگھ صاحب کا ذکر نہیں ہے۔ یا منسٹریل ریسپانسیبلیٹیز کا ذکر نہیں ہے کچھ منسٹرس کا۔ کچھ آفیسرس کا۔ کچھ محکموں کا ذکر ہے۔ اور سی۔ بی۔ آئی۔ کا ذکر ہے کچھ ایسی پی۔ ایس۔ یوز کا ذکر ہے جو براہ راست پرائم منسٹر صاحب کے ماتحت آتے ہیں تو میں جاننا چاہتا ہوں کہ ان تمام باتوں کا باقی چیزوں کے سلسلے میں گورنمنٹ کے ریسپانسیز کیا ہیں۔ ریسپانسیز کا پتہ چلے تو جے۔ پی۔ سی۔ کی رپورٹ پر بحث کرنے کا کوئی مقصد۔ کوئی مطلب نکل سکتا ہے۔ لہذا میری درخواست یہ ہے کہ اس سلسلے میں گورنمنٹ سے کہا جائے کہ وہ اپنے ریسپانسیز بتائیں....."مداخلت".....]

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh) : Madam....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute, Mr. Jaipal Reddy. Will you know the facts ? Mr. Sikander Bakht wrote a letter to the Chairman which came to me today, and I gave him permission because he asked for it. But you did not write to me. You did not ask for it. So, I will ask the Minister for Parliamentary Affairs first to clarify what Mr. Sikander Bakht has raised.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Madam..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please. Just a minute. Let his queries be clarified.

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT : I raised three points.

THE MINISTER OF WATER RESOURCES AND THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI VIDYACHARAN SHUKLA) : Madam.. *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I saw him. He was here. The Chair cannot give a ruling on these things.

SHRI VIDYACHARAN SHUKLA : Madam, this Committee was constituted by both the Houses of Parliament, and the opinion expressed in both the Houses of Parliament by hon. Members must be taken into account before the Government analyses in depth various observations made by the Committee and also

goes into the recommendations made by the Committee. The decisions on the Committee's observations and recommendations will have to be taken after taking the opinion of various Members of the House in a proper manner. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Let him finish what he wants to say. It is a very serious matter. We are going to discuss it. Let us discuss it in a peaceful atmosphere. Please let him finish at least.

SHRI VIDYACHARAN SHUKLA : This is the system we have been following and we intend to follow. We respectfully listen to various viewpoints expressed in this House, and after we have the benefit of the opinions expressed in this House and in the other House, we will then.. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute, please. He has not completed. Still words are in his mouth. Let him finish.

SHRI VIDYACHARAN SHUKLA : We will then initiate the entire process of analysing this Report and the subsequent action. As far as this report in the press is concerned, this is only their own information on which there has been no announcement and no authoritative statement has been made on this by the Government. I don't think Members should take the press reports on this matter seriously. We will take full time to do whatever is necessary as a consequence of the opinions expresesd in this House and in the other House and I can assure the hon. Members and this House that we attach utmost importance to the report given by the Joint Parliamentary Committee and also to the opinions that might be expressed here in this House by the hon. Members. After hearing the views of the hon. Members, whatever action is necessary, will be taken by the Government.... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT : JPC's Report is the ultimate document. The JPC has already expressed its opinion. The Minister has said nothing about the setting up of the panel. Why was this announcement not made in the House and why did it go to the press ?.... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Madam, ... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute please. I would not hear you till I clarify his queries. I cannot get everybody's queries clarified at the same time. The Minister, as I heard.....

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : The Minister is making an atrocious statement.... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Sikander Bakht Saheb, as I heard the Minister, he said that this panel is not being constituted. This is as I heard. So it is over.

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN (Maharashtra) : He did not say so.... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT : The Union Government has constituted a high-powered committee. What is this ? .... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The trouble is, you all speak together and do not want the Minister to answer and put words in his mouth. Let him finish and then you say whatever you want to say.

SHRI VIDYACHARAN SHUKLA : Madam, I have already explained that the Government will take action to examine this Report after hearing the views of the hon. Members in this House.... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Listen to him. Again you get up. That is not proper. I am very sorry that senior Members also who have the experience of the House even more than myself, should behave like this. Please let him finish. He is on his feet. Let him finish.

SHRI VIDYACHARAN SHUKLA : The Report of the Joint Parliamentary Committee has to be analysed by the hon. Members. All Members did not have the privilege of serving on this Committee.

and as the normal convention goes, the Members who did not serve on the Committee, should be able to express their view-points. It is not necessary that all Members belonging to various sections of the House may have the same opinion that the JPC may have expressed unanimously or otherwise. Therefore, the system in the parliamentary procedure is that those Members who did not have the benefit of being members of the JPC should be given a chance to express their views. Their views are as valuable as the views expressed by the members of the JPC. Therefore, we have to hear all those things before we finally accept it.... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : What is this ?

SHRI VIDYACHARAN SHUKLA : Therefore, we have to take the opinion of all the Members. I have already said, we have done nothing of the sort.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He has said no high-powered committee is constituted.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Will you kindly hear me ? .... (*Interruptions*)....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am not allowing a discussion before the discussion starts on this Report.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Madam, the statement of the Minister needs to be discussed.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am not allowing any more discussion.

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT : He is denigrating the status of the JPC.... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : This is to belittle the status of the JPC. Madam, there is a point raised by the Leader of the Opposition.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Jaipal Reddy, please sit down.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : I have been rising from the beginning, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Never mind. The point is, the discussion on the report of the J.P.C..... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH (Bihar) : Madam, I am on a point of order.

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA (Gujarat) : I am on a point of order.

SHRI PRAKASH YASHWANT AMBEDKAR (Nominated) : Madam, I am on a point of order.... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Madam, the report of the Committee is unanimous. Therefore, Parliament has to discuss it in the light of the reaction of the Government thereto. Parliament cannot discuss the report in a vaccum. Parliament has to discuss the report in the light of the reaction of the Government to the report.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Let us start the discussion first... (*Interruptions*) Mr. Reddy, I am not allowing because Members of the House wanted that we should have a special Session to discuss the report. How can we start the discussion before even the Member in whose name it stands has moved the motion ?

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Madam, what I am saying is that the discussion cannot be held in a vaccuum.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : There is no vacuum. I am there. You are there.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : We do not know the mind of the Government. The report of the J.P.C. is unanimous. It is final. It is conclusive. .... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRAKASH YASHWANT AMBEDKAR : Madam, I am on a point of order.... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute. I will allow you. The Minister of Parliamentary Affairs, Mrs. Margaret Alva, wants to say something.... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : I must have my say..... (*Interruptions*)

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PERSONNEL, PUBLIC GRIEVENCES AND PENSIONS AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRIMATI MARGRET ALVA) : Mr. Jaipal Reddy, the Deputy Chairman has allowed me..... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have given my ruling.... (*Interruptions*) I have given my ruling. This business is listed. I will go according to the listed business.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : What business ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Let me be heard, Mr. Reddy, please. Every Member of this House was keen that we should discuss the J.P.C. report on the 23rd itself. (Interruptions) Mr. Reddy, please. You were also a party to it. Since everybody said that we should discuss the report, the Session was extended. That is how we are sitting here today, today and tomorrow, to discuss the report which is listed. I will not allow anything else on this subject until and unless.... (*Interruptions*) You do not even hear me, Mr. Reddy. This is very bad. This is not the correct way of behaving. This item is listed in the name of Mr. Ashok Mitra. Until and unless he moves the motion, until and unless he raises the issue, we cannot start any discussion on it. Let him move the motion first.

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: सदर साहिबा, मेरे दो सवाल थे । आप क्या सेटिस्फाइड हैं ?

†[شری سکندر بخت : صدر صاحبہ۔ میرے دو سوال تھے۔ آپ کیا سیٹسفائیڈ ہیں ۔۔۔۔]

Can the House reject the report or accept it ? Can the Government do it ?

उसके लिए क्या कहना है ? उसके लिए आपकी साफ रूलिंग होनी चाहिए । दूसरा कांस्टीटेंयूशन आफ दि कमेटी है । इस कमेटी के कांस्टीट्यूशन का ऐनाउंसमेंट होनी चाहिए, उसको कोई जवाब नहीं आया ।

†[اسکے لئے کیا کہنا ہے۔ اسکے لئے آپکی صاف رولنگ ہونی چاہئے۔ دوسرا کانسٹی ٹیوشنل آف دی کمیٹی ہے اس کمیٹی کی کانسٹی ٹیوشن کا اناونسمنٹ ہونا چاہئے۔ اسکا کوئی جواب نہیں آیا۔]

Are you satisfied with his reply ? He is only scuttling the issue ?

इश्यूज को आप स्कटल करते हैं । ... (व्यवधान)

†[ایشوز کو آپ اسکٹل کرتے ہیں ۔۔۔۔ "مداخلت" ۔۔۔۔]

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI (Uttar Pradesh) : Madam, I want a categorical answer from the hon. Minister whether the high-powered committee has been constituted or has not been constituted. Let him reply to this question.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He has already said it.

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI : What did he say ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You did not allow him to be heard.

---

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI : He did not say anything. (*Interruptions*) He said one thing once and he said something else later on. He shifted his stand. I would like to know which one of his statements is correct. (*Interruptions*) I seek your protection, Madam. This is a very important issue. The House is in Session. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : There is total confusion. When your leader is speaking, let him be heard. I do not know what he is saying. Why do you want to create confusion ? (*Interruptions*)

श्री मुरली मनोहर जोशी : मैं चाहता हूं कि मंत्री महोदय इस भ्रम का निराकरण करें, स्पष्ट होकर इस हाउस को बतायें कि हाई पैनल बाडी बनाई गई है अथवा नहीं ? सीधा-सीधा इस बात का जवाब दें। (व्यवधान) बिल्कुल सीधी बात का जवाब हम चाहते हैं। आप से प्रोटेक्शन मांगना चाहते हैं क्योंकि हाउस सैशन में है। एक पालिसी डिसीजन लिया गया है, हाउस के बाहर भी अनाउन्स किया गया है। दोनों हाउसेज सेशन में हैं तो इस बारे में हम जानना चाहते हैं।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : यह जवाब जब आएगा तब आपको पता चल जाएगा।

That is my ruling. Now, no more. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (Uttar Pradesh) : I have a simple point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Yes.

SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH : Madam, I was the first to raise my point of order. (*Interruptions*). I was the first man.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : To me everybody is the first.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Madam, my simple point of order is this. The Minister has said that the views of those who are not members of the Committee are also equally important, they must be heard. Madam Deputy Chairman, the report of the Committee was unanimous. If the Congress Party which is the ruling party decides to issue a whip to its Members to support the views of its Members, you will just get a repetition of what has happened in the Committee. It will just be unnecessarily taking the time of the House. So, a free discussion can only take place if the Members of the ruling party have freedom to deviate....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : That is not a point of order according to the Chair. There is no point of order.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : You have accepted the Mintister's point of view.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : It is irrelevant.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Otherwise, a unanimous report of the Committee will find the same unanimity here.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute. .... (*Interruptions*) Order. Mr. Subramanian Swamy, what you have raised is not relating to the functioning of this House, it is related to the Congress Party and you can raise it at a party level. I do not want to say about that. (*Interruptions*) It is entirely for the Congress Party to decide what they want to do. (*Interruptions*) It is none of your business.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : It is wrong on your part to say that the views of your Members will be different when they will be asked to speak on a whip. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will call you after him.

SHRI S.K.T. RAMACHANDRAN (Tamil Nadu) : Just now you said that Mr. Swamy could raise this point at a

Congress Party meeting. When did he join the Congress Party ? (*Interruption*)

(व्यवधान)

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है ....

श्री रजनी रंजन साहू : (बिहार) पहले यह तय कर लें कि कौन बोलेगा, यह बोलेंगे या गुजराल साहब बोलेंगे (व्यवधान) ।

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : मेरा जो व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है वह रूल नं. 212 एच के बारे में है ।

Rule 212H (2)(c) relating to Committee on Papers laid on the Table says :

"Whether the paper has been laid before the Council both in English and Hindi and if not, (i) Whether a statement explaining the reasons for not laying the paper in Hindi has also been laid before the Council along with the paper, and (ii) whether those reasons are satisfactory."

जिस दिन यानी 22 तारीख को यह रिपोर्ट पेश की गई, अहलुवालिया जी जो इस सदन के माननीय सदस्य हैं, ने पेश की थी । उस में लिखा था-बोथ इन हिन्दी एंड इंगलिश । उस दिन मैंने इन्क्वायर किया हिन्दी कापी के बारे में और मैं हिन्दी कापी लेने गया तो मुझे वह हिन्दी कापी नहीं मिली । उस समय मैंने आपत्ति की थी कि जब ले कर दी जाती है रिपोर्ट तो मिलनी चाहिए। जब रिपोर्ट ले ली गई थी उसमें ब्रेकेट में भी लिखा है बोथ हिन्दी एंड इंगलिश, तो दोनों भाषाओं में एवेलेबल होनी चाहिए। कुछ देर बाद हिन्दी कापी मिली । मैं आप से अनुरोध करना चाहता हूं कि केवल एक खंड उस दिन उसका मिला ।

और दूसरा खण्ड आज मिला, एवेलेबल नहीं था । मेरे जैसे कुछ लोग जो अंग्रेजी नहीं जानते हैं या कम जानते हैं, उनके लिए यह जरूरी है क्योंकि हम अपना काम इसकी मदद से करते हैं । आज यह दूसरी कापी हमें एवेलेबल हुई है । इस पर मैं बोलने वाला हूं । इसमें दो बातें हैं। एक तो आप हमें दो खण्डों में एनाऊंस कीजिए । आज एक खण्ड पर बोल लें और कल दूसरे खण्ड पर बोलें । इस पर आप अपनी व्यवस्था दें । आज दूसरा खण्ड मिला है । पहला खण्ड उस दिन मिला था । इस बारे में मैं आपसे व्यवस्था चाहता हूं । जब इस तरह की बात हो तो संविधान की मर्यादा के अनुसार इसको गम्भीरता से लेना चाहिए और इसका रीजन दिया जाना चाहिए । लास्ट दो, आपसे यह कहना चाहता हूं कि आज के अखबारों में एक समाचार आया है । इस समाचार में बताया गया है कि इस सदन के हमारे एक माननीय सदस्य श्री मलंग सिंह जी के घर पर कुछ संसद सदस्यों की बैठक हुई और यह तय किया गया कि अगर डिबेट में प्रधान मंत्री का नाम लिया जाएगा, रेजिग्नेशन मांगेंगे तो उनको बोलने नहीं दिया जाएगा.... (व्यवधान) । यह मैं अखबारों से कोट कर रहा हूं । यह फ्रन्ट पेज पर है । हम डिबेट में भाग लेंगे । यह बड़ा गम्भीर मामला है और प्रिविलेजज का मामला है ... (व्यवधान) ।

"According to Mrs. Margaret Alva, there are numerous loopholes in the JPC report and 'we will not allow the Opposition to criticise the Government just because the Opposition was trying to embarrass the Government."

SHRI SURESH KALMADI (Maharashtra) : And he says he doesn't know English !

SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH : I am quoting Mrs. Margaret Alva.... (*Interruptions*)..

उपसभापति : शंकर दयाल सिंह जी, आप बैठिए । आपको अखबार से पढ़ने की अनुमति नहीं दी गई है ।

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : मैं यह कहना चाहता हूं कि .... (व्यवधान) ।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am not giving you permission.

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : हम जो विपक्ष के लोग हैं, हम सरकार से परमिशन मांगेंगे, हम सरकार को क्रिटिसाइज करने वाले हैं और भ्रष्टाचार के मामले में सरकार को डोक पर रखने वाले हैं । इस तरह की बातें हों और एक मिनिस्टर कहें कि

हक बोलने नहीं देंगे, यह ठीक नहीं है । हमारे एक साथी के घर पर 25-30 लोगों को खाने पर बुलाया जाऐ . . . . (**व्यवधान**) ।

उपसभापति : शंकर दयाल सिंह जी, आप बैठिए । आपने जो रिपोर्ट की हिन्दी कापी की बात कही, मैंने इस बारे में सेक्रेटरिएट से पूछा है । सुषमा स्वराज जी उस समय चेयर पर थीं । उन्होंने इस बारे में आपको बताया और हाउस में रिपोर्ट की दोनों कापियां दिखाई। आपको यह कापी आज क्यों मिली, उस दिन क्यों नहीं मिली, इसके बारे में जानकारी करूंगी कि रिपोर्ट की सेकेन्ड कापी आपको क्यों नहीं मिली। आपको इस बारे में बताऊंगी ।

श्रीमति सुषमा स्वराज (हरियाणा) : मैंने रिपोर्ट की दोनों कापियां दिखाई थीं ।

उपसभापति : उन्होंने दोनों रिपोर्ट दिखाई थीं । लेकिन आपको दूसरी रिपोर्ट क्यों नहीं मिली, इसके बारे में जानकारी लेकर आपको बता दूंगी । अब रही बात अखबारों की, मारग्रेट आल्वा जी ने किस को खाना खिलाया, किस को क्या कहा,

I am not concerned with it. I will allow the discussion in the House. That has nothing to do with it...(*Interruptions*).. If you all want to have vyavastha-ka-prashn, then I will have only vyavastha-ka-prashn. Then I will not allow people to discuss anything else..(*Interruptions*).. No, this is not the way.

श्रीमति सुषमा स्वराज : मैडम, मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है · · · (**व्यवधान**) जब संसदीय कार्य मंत्री स्वयं अव्यवस्था प्रकट करेंगे तो व्यवस्था का प्रश्न उठेगा ही · · · · (**व्यवधान**) ।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I won't allow anything..(*Interruptions*)..

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA : Madam, I want to....(*Interruptions*)..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : An allegation has been levelled. Let her speak. She has a right for a personal explanation. Please keep quite.

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA (Uttar Pradesh) : Shri Shankar Dayal Singh has only read out a press report.

उपसभापति : वह भी अंग्रेजी का जो उनको आती नहीं है ।

डा. मुरली मनोहर जोशी : वही जो हमको आती है वह बात उन्होंने ठीक ठीक पढ़ी है ।

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA : Mr. Shankar Dayal Singh has just said that he is not able to read English.

वे सभी बोल रहे थे कि हमारे जैसे लोग जो अंग्रेजी नहीं पढ़ सकते, वे इसको कैसे पढ़ेंगे, और अब वे अंग्रेजी में कोटेशन दे रहे हैं । . . . (**व्यवधान**) · · · ·

उपसभापति : उनको जवाब देने दीजिए ।

I will give her all protection. She has got a right to explain it.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA : I want to make it very clear that I have not hosted any meal for anybody in connection with this Report or in connection with anything else.

Secondly, Madam, I was simply asked whether I was issuing a whip in connection with the discussion today. I have made very clear about it. I think it is for the Members to go through the Report and express their views. There are loopholes. There are various versions from different Members who are not memebers of the Committee. They have a right to read the Report and speak what they have to speak. I did say this, but I never said either that we were accepting it or that we were rejecting it.

Madam, let me point out that they were asked to be present in the House. I would like to point out that this discussion has been admitted.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : My point has been well taken... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Murli Bhandare, will you please allow the Minister to speak and to be heard ?

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA : This discussion has been admitted as a Short-Duration Discussion. The names of all Members of all parties on the other side appear, including Mr. Sikander Bakht, Mr. Shankar Dayal Singh and others. As per the Rules Book, on a Short-Duration Discussion there shall be no formal motion before the Council or voting on it. The Member who has given the notice, may make a statement, and others may speak. This is the point about a Short-Duration Discussion. There is no need for Government to come here with any formal motion. You say you are discussing it in a vacuum. The notice is for a Short-Duration Discussion. . . (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No. One minute.

SHRI SANGH PRIYA GAUTAM : *

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Don't write it. If anybody speaks without my permission, don't write what he says.. (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA : There is no need for us to come with any motion or statement to start the Discussion. It is for you to start the discussion. The Government will reply to what you say.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Okay. Now that is clear.. (*Interruptions*)

आप बैठ जाइये । .... (व्यवधान) ... आप बैठिए ।

SHRI PRAKASH YASHWANT AMBEDKAR : May, may I speak ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Yes. .. (*Interruptions*)

Just a minute, just a minute.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL (Bihar) : Madam, may I start shouting now ? I have been standing for half an hour. You are not allowing me to speak.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will allow you. You cannot speak when others are speaking.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL : You called everybody except me.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : That is not correct because you cannot speak when two, three persons are speaking together. I have to call everybody by turn. Everybody has got a turn to speak. If you want to speak together with two other persons, fine, you are most welcome. I am trying to give respect to you for your age and your experience. That is why I will finish it and come to you. Can you wait for two minutes ?.. (*Interruptions*)

श्री चिमन भाई मेहता : एज का भी ख्याल रखें।

I will put 500 "please" raised to the power of 1 million, please.

SHRI PRAKASH YASHWANT AMBEDKAR : Madam, both the Parliamentary Affairs Ministers have said that the JPC Report is open for discussion. As far as I understand the JPC is a mini-Parliament in itself. All the powers of the Members of Parliament sitting in this House and in the other House are abrogated and given to the JPC. The JPC has given its opinion. That opinion, as far as I understand, is binding on each Member of this House. Once the JPC Report and its opinion is binding, can that be open for discussion

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No, is not binding. . . (*Interruptions*)

*Not recorded

SHRI PRAKASH YASHWANT AMBEDKAR : Madam, I want a ruling from you.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No . . (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRAKASH YASHWANT AMBEDKAR : The opinion expressed by the JPC is binding on the Members of the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No, no, it is not. Please sit down.

आप बैठ जाइए ।

If everybody wants to raise a point of order, how are we going to start the Discussion ?

SHRI PRAKASH YASHWANT AMBEDKAR : What is the ruling ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No ruling on it is required because it does not come under any ruling; it does not come under any discussion or a point of order. Please sit down. People raise issues under the cover of a point of order.

आप बैठ जाइए

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA : I have been standing for half an hour to raise a point of order.

उपसभापति : गुजराल साहब बोल रहे हैं । ... (व्यवधान)

That does not give you a prerogative. It is for the Chair.

आप बैठ जाइए । गुजराल साहब आप बोलिए ।

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL : Madam, my hon. friend, the Minister, has made a rather odd statement. He thinks that the JPC Report which has been written by all the parties together unanimously, can be a subject of discussion here. Main point basically is, does he believe that the Parliament should be pitted against the JPC ? Does he not believe ? Yes, Madam, I will finish. I will explain to you. Let me elaborate.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I thought you wanted the discussion.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL : I have seen your point of surprise. I am coming to that. The main point is what we are going to discuss. We are going to discuss whether the Government accepts the Report, rejects the Report; whether the Government wants to take any action on some poins raised by the Report. This statement should come from them. For a Minister to come and say that he would make up his mind only after hearing the Parliament is something very odd to my mind. Therefore, what I am submitting to you is that the Minister must let us know (1) what is the Government's attitude towards the Report ? (2) What is the Government's attitude towards the recommendations made by the Committee ? (3) What is the action plan made by the Government on this issue ? Because, as my friend, Mr. Sikander Bakht has pointed out, some action has already been initiated. As such this is very important.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He denied it.

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ : He did not deny it.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL : He did not deny it.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : If you feel that he has not . . (*Interruptions*) Just a minute. Please, it is not fair on the part of the Members not to allow a proper discussion and deprive the Member in whose name the motion is written and ask all the questions under the cover of points of order. These things can be taken up in the discussion and you can ask

the Government to come forward to answer whatever you want. I will ask Mr. Mehta.. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT : Are you satisfied with the constitution of the Committee ? Are you satisfied whether the Committee has been constituted or not ?

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : मैडम, मुझ को दो मिनट दे दीजिए ... (व्यवधान) ।

उपसभापति : मैं उससे कहा रही हूं, आपसे नहीं कह रही हूं ... (व्यवधान) ।

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : मैडम, आपने सब को इजाजत दी है (व्यवधान) मुझे दो मिनट दे दीजिए ... (व्यवधान) ।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : It is not the question of my satisfaction. It is a question of Members satisfaction. I run the House not for my satisfaction, I run the House for the satisfaction of the House. It is not a question of my being satisfied.

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI : We are not satisfied. Members are not satisfied by the answer of the Minister.

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : मैडम, मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है ... (व्यवधान)

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI : Madam, would you check record ? (*Interruptions*) Madam, I plead you check the record..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will check the record.

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI :.. and see whether the Minister is made two statements which are contradictory.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will.

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI : Will you check the record

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I say yes, I will. Hundred times I say will. Satisfied. O.K.

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA : What about my point of order ? I am raising my point of order..

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : ऐसे डिसकशन शुरू नहीं हो सकता ... (व्यवधान) ।

SHRI E. BALANANDAN (Kerala) : I want to invite the attention of the House to only one point. It is not about the Report.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : What is it about ?

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA : But I have been raising my point of order..

SHRI E. BALANANDAN : An assurance was given by the Minister for Communications to be postal employees that they will not be victimised after the strike was withdrawn. Now the Government is.. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am not allowing. This is not the way. Please sit down.

SHRI E. BALANANDAN : I am saying something else. Now, the Government is taking action against the postal employees. It is against the assurance given by the Government. So, I want the Government to see that the Government's assurance to the postal employees is honoured. That is all I want to say.

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA : Yes. Now, you should ask me.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. MEHTA, is it regarding the Report ?

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA : Yes.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Before I allow a discussion on it I have to allow

him a personal explanation. Do you want to deprive him of his personal explanation ?

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA : I am not depriving him. My point of order is something different. (*Interruptions*) I just want to ask in half a minute.

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : मैडम, मेरा एक मिनट का व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है (व्यवधान) आप मुझे व्यवस्था का प्रश्न नहीं उठाने दे रही हैं (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : फिर आप बीच में दो दो लोग बोलने लग जाते हैं । (व्यवधान) ।

Let me settle one question first.

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ : Why don't you settle me first ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have settled you. You please sit down.

SHRIMATI KAMLA SINHA (Bihar) : This is an atrocity against a woman by a woman.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I do not think anybody is serious to discuss this Report. We called the House for two days specially. Everybody came here and nobody is interested to start the discussion. I am very sorry. I am making such a remark because nobody is serious about it. Think about yourself. What you have said, I will see the record.

आप बैठिए । (व्यवधान) बोलिए ।

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ : Why should I not be allowed ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : It is entirely up to the Chair to allow. Look at the rules, please. You are also a Vice-Chairman.

उपसभापति : अच्छा, आप अपनी बात बोलिए मेरे बारे में छोड़िए ।

श्री चिमनभाई मेहता : मैं हाउस की चिंता करता हूं ... (व्यवधान) एक घंटे में 20 लाख हमने वेस्ट कर दिए हैं ...

उपसभापति : ठीक है आप बोल लीजिए ।

Don't waste the time of the House.

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA : Now I am coming to the point. Madam, I would like to know whether a report of this nature has ever been discussed in this House without Government's comment on the report. This is very important.. If you are setting a new precedent, then, I would like to know why a new precedent is being set up. If reports were discussed, in the past without Government's comment, then, under the Short Duration Discussion, how is it that this question can be raised at this hour when Rs. 20 lakhs has already been spent for one hour of the time of the House ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I agree with you. I should have asked you to speak first.

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA : Madam, Mr. Subramanian Swamy has rightly pointed out that in no Western democracy or mother of democracy a whip is ever issued either on ethical issues or on moral issues. This is not a party policy matter. I am happy to hear Mrs. Margaret Alva when she has clarified that no whip was issued. It should be carried in spirit by the Members of the Congress party or by the Members belonging to the Opposition. Although it has been said that Shri Manmohan Singh has not resigned, you may say something else. So no whip should be issued..... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Okay, please keep quiet.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry) : Madam, what right have they got to advise us ? Mr. Subramanan Swamy should discharged his functions..... (*Interruptions*)....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Narayanasamy, please keep quiet. It is his individual.... (*Interruptions*).. ..

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Please make him a Minister.

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA : Under the Constitution or under the Anti-Defection Act, no whip can ever be issued on an issue of this nature. Thank you very much.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Thank you very much.... (*Interruptions*).... *No* more point of order. What Sushma was saying, I do not know. But I am very serious about it. I must place it on record again and everybody should know about it. Mr. Sikander Bakhtji wrote a letter saying that he wanted to raise some issue. But that doesn't mean that under that letter everybody.... (*Interruptions*)....

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ : I am raising a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You do not know what the point of order is. A point of order can be raised only..... (*Interruptions*)....

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ : But don't say that I do not know what the point of order is.

उपसभापति : आप सभी बैठिए ... (व्यवधान)

A point of order can be raised on the issues which are under discussion. I have not yet started the Short Duration Discussion.

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ : No, I am on a point of order on a statement by the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : But that was a reply by the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs to Mr. Sikander Bakht's letter. We cannot start a discussion on it. I will not permit any discussion on Mr. Shukla's statement.

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ : Without listening to my point of order, you cannot give your ruling.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am not allowing. Enough is enough.

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ : But you yourself said that you do not know what I am going to say.... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT : There should be straightforward replies by the Minister to the straightforward questions. For that a ruling has to come from you.

उपसभापति : एक मिनट आप बैठिये (व्यवधान) सत्य प्रकाश जी आप बोलिए ... (व्यवधान)

Please sit down.

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : लेकिन अगर मंत्री महोदय... (व्यवधान)

आप एलाउ करें या न करें आपका डिसक्रीशन है लेकिन ... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : One hour of the House has been wasted unnecessarily.

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA : You give a ruling whether there was a precedent or not.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Yes, it was under a Short Duration Discussion. I am allowing Mr. Satya Prakash Malaviya. He has asked my permission to give a personal explanation because his name was mentioned in the report.

PERSONAL EXPLANATION

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA (Uttar Pradesh) : Madam Deputy Chairman, have already submitted a capy of my personal explanation to yo which I am going to read with your permission . Madam Deputy Chairman, I thank you very much for very kindly permitting me to offer my